

Threatened Existence: A Feminist Analysis of the Genocide in Gujarat

Report by the International Initiative for Justice (IIJ)

December 2003

Those Who Spoke to the IIJ

Many women and men survivors from the Muslim community, as well as activists, social workers, lawyers spoke to the panel. We cannot give details about their situation, or geographical locations for fear of getting identified and further targeted in their areas. Here are salient points from each of the persons who spoke to the panel, braving the difficult situation and constant threats of attacks.

W1PW1: She was completely dispossessed of house, as well as land. Received no compensation at all. Has been threatened by Hindu villagers so cannot return to own village. The priest in the village tricked and betrayed them, led them to a lynching mob.

W2PW2: The mosque in her village was also attacked and a flag of the temple was hoisted on it. Quran was also burnt. She used to survive as a agricultural labourer. Now she cannot go back to her village.

W3PW3: Her family home and shop were completely burnt. They managed to save their rickshaw. In the 1992 communal violence also they had lost everything. Last time they could return to their village but this time they cannot due to threats.

W4PW4: She is displaced from her village and lives in small rented rooms elsewhere. Her family members were killed in the carnage. She gave a report of sexual assault to the police but the next day the police asked for her signature on blank paper. She wants to fight the case and feels strengthened because of the support from women around her, but is also continuously worried about safety.

W5PW5: She is fighting a case in court. The accused are also present in court. The court does not want to hear actual witnesses. She has witnessed killings and sexual assaults on close family members. Attackers are still freely roaming around. But she will keep her strength and hopefully will win.

W6PW6: She says that her mind has stopped functioning because of the continuous stress. Her family members are missing from the carnage. If they go back to their village they are driven away, by threats of being cut up. They used to give alms and were economically well off. Now they have to stand in queue in wait for alms when people come. She feels that the outside world must put pressure on government.

W7PW7: She went back to her village to vote during the elections. At that point, the Hindu villagers threatened them saying they had burnt houses but now they will put the Muslims in shredding machines.

W8PW8: She cannot go back to her village. The Sarpanch, who is a woman from the Hindu community, during the carnage went around with kerosene cans to burn their houses and she now tells the Muslims to not come back to the village.

W9PW9: When she and others fled through the forest, they were barefoot, and thorns got embedded in their feet. Her husband was doused with petrol and then his limbs were chopped off before he was burnt. She demands that the perpetrators be arrested and punished.

W10PW10: She feels that if the BJP comes to power all of them will be under more pressure to withdraw their fight for justice, because the BJP is behind all the attacks.

W11PW11: The Hindu attackers have not even left a spoon in the village; everything has been destroyed and looted. The Hindus in her village don't let the Muslims do business or live in the village. The Muslims in her village cannot even see their houses, let alone go back to the village.

W12PW12: She feels that the Hindu attackers will attack again. When they go to their village, the village people shout slogans: "lungi in the hand, paan in the mouth, drive them to Pakistan". Even though this is the fourth generation of Muslim families that have been living there.

W13PW13: She is extremely afraid of BJP coming to power again. These politicians do not allow the local Hindu community to come for the peace meetings. The VHP stops them. She said that in many cases the owners of houses got the compensation, the tenant did not get anything. It has happened especially to single women.

W14PW14: She expressed that a woman knows another woman's pain and neither the police nor the public can understand this. She feels that there should be change within the police and women should be brought into the force.

W15PW15: She is one of the few women who studied and completed school. Her dreams are of education for women. She was away when the carnage started. Now works to take initiative amongst women and children.

W16PW16: Started working with a non-government organization for women after the carnage where they create space for sharing their experiences, discuss issues of identity, the violence witnessed by them and other issues.

W17PW17: She stated that in normal circumstances, you look to the police, the bureaucracy, and the parliament to deliver. In this carnage doctors and government officials who were Muslims too had to flee. If they too were in no position to get help, then one can understand how big the conspiracy was. She spoke of the violence faced by women and the continued threat to them. In her village, young girls are still teased and are scared.

W18PW18: She told that, even now, no woman could go to the bazaar. During the carnage, they were stripped and made to walk, had been beaten – all in the open market and all the way to the police station. They were told to give away their daughters to be kept. Now, their neighbours have been saying that if the BJP comes to power they would be killed and their dead bodies will be sent in a parcel to Pakistan.

W19PW19: She is an activist who gave up wearing the burkha after the carnage. Now she helps people get rations, relief stuff etc. She says that those who bear oppression are as wrong as those who perpetrate it.... and it is because that they didn't stop things that so many women were assaulted so badly.

W20PW20: She also gave a written document detailing the violence and the fact that they got no help from police. She spoke about the constant insecurity that they have to live with.

W21PW21: She gave a written document stating how violence was unleashed on the Muslim community in her village and even now how they are living in fear

W22PW24: A widow from the Muslim community whose husband and other family members were killed in the carnage. Only a fraction of the Muslim people returned to her village. A mob of 10,000 people had attacked them. She feels that it is difficult to trust the people in her village after what took place. She is now living in a charitable place out of desperation where she at least gets two meals a day.

W23PW26: A widow who witnessed many people, including family members, getting killed during the carnage. The police were standing and watching. She and her family members were badly injured. The mobs looted goats and cattle, and stole her husband's tools, machinery, jewellery, everything. She is surviving with her children on compensation and fears what will happen after that is over.

W24PW27: Her family members, including her husband, were killed in the carnage. Initially she lived in a charitable place but there was no freedom to meet anyone or go and work. Earlier she had a vegetable stall in her village. Now she cannot even set up small stall because of the fear of people taking goods without paying.

W25PW28: During the violence she was separated from her children for 10 days. Her child was born in the relief camp. She now has no family support and lives on charity. Even her young daughter does some wage labour to earn money.

W26PW29: She is a widow and is staying with help of a charitable trust. She cannot go back to her village as there was stone throwing on them even as recently as Ramzan. The fear of getting beaten up and violence is very real.

W27PW30: She lives with the help of a charitable trust. Her family members were killed in the carnage. She cannot go back to her village because of the fear of further attacks. She is not able to even educate her children as they could not get admission in the school where they are now staying.

W28PW31: Her husband was killed in the violence. He was hit by a sword and then burnt. Other family members were also hacked to death. The joint family property is now lying barren. The mobs took their goats and the buffalos died out of neglect. She cannot go back to her village and now lives on charity.

W29PW32: She has witnessed killings and sexual assaults during the carnage. She wants to fight and get justice. Initially she knew very little about how to go ahead but now has gathered courage and resolved to struggle.

W30PW34: She is a woman activist from the Hindu community who is helping survivors of the carnage. She feels that livelihood needs to be addressed especially as it is linked to security. Says that the leaders of the carnage were not local. Tractor loads of liquor and kerosene were brought into the area. The VHP and Bajrang Dal were able to build the trust and faith of the tribals and mobilise them through training programmes.

W31PW35: She is a woman activist from the Hindu community helping in the process of rehabilitation. She helped survivors go back and rebuild their lives. She feels that the protection of witnesses is extremely important.

W32PW36: She is a woman activist from the Muslim community who helped in various relief camps and the women in relief camps. Her women relatives from other villages were sexually assaulted. Since they have shifted from their village children do not get admission in current place. She is haunted by the memories of violence. She is working strengthening women through education and independent means of livelihood.

W33PW37: She is a woman activist and lawyer from the Muslim community who is helping women in their struggle for justice. She spoke of the struggle with other lawyers and activists to highlight the issue of rape, because often where both have taken place, murder is prioritised over rape. In many cases where rape and murder happened together, rape often happens to just be a part of the complaint. Families are also ashamed that they couldn't 'save' the women. Many people don't see that as act of violence but as an act of shame within the private sphere.

W34PW38: She is a woman activist from the Hindu community who spoke about female-headed households, the situation of widows, their livelihood issues, single women, and various ways in which they attempt to negotiate the system.

W35PW40: She is a woman activist from the Hindu community who witnessed the post result scene in this area Gujarat. She spoke about the need for additional non-partisan police. She expressed the fear that the police and security forces will not reach the villages in time, given the level of tension in the air when the results were announced.

W35PW41: She is a woman activist from the Muslim community working with a women's organisation which was helping survivors with relief and with means of livelihood. She described her experiences when doing relief work and work that needs to be done to help people find more permanent means of livelihood.

W36PW42: She is a woman activist from the Muslim community. She helped in various relief camps. She expressed the need for education for women. She felt that if the girls had been educated they could have protected themselves. They did not know anything about FIRs etc. when they were attacked in the recent violence. The need for women to be economically independent is strong.

W37PW43: She is a woman activist from the Hindu community who has worked in various disaster situations. She spoke that livelihood planning should always depend on local skills and natural resources. We have to develop a strategy for livelihoods, in terms of creating markets.

W38BW1: She has not been able to go back to her village. She has no source of income and the grain given by the government is over. She is staying with her relatives and the relatives are also asking her to leave. Her 3 daughters, who were in high school, have had to stop their education.

W39BW2: She told the panel of her 32-year old brother, who was disabled, was killed in November while travelling back from his work. The mob got onto the bus by stoning and stopping it. He could not run as he was disabled. He was axed to death. His wife and children are also ill. The police have left all the people who were held responsible and arrested earlier.

W40BW3: She is a resident of village BV9 in taluka BV5. She is a survivor of sexual violence and narrated to the panel how she was gang-raped and brutally sexually assaulted more than once by different mobs on the 1st of March 2002. Her young child was also brutally battered.

W41BW4: She, her daughters and her husband were badly beaten up by a large mob on the 1st of March 2002 and the entire family is physically and mentally badly affected by the gruesome violence they experienced. BW4 has refused to acknowledge the rape of her daughters because she is afraid that they will not get suitable marriage offers.

W42BW8: She and her sister were abducted by a mob of men on the 3rd of March 2002 and taken to another village and locked them up. They said obscene things to the two, abused them, tore off their clothes, brutalized them and robbed them of their belongings. When the women managed to ultimately escape, the men also tried to chase them.

W43BW10: She, 7 other girls and 8 men were surrounded by a mob when they were trying to run to a safer place. The mob threatened the men with swords and hit the men, including members of her family, with iron rods till they lost consciousness. They took the women to the fields and started shouting dirty abuses at them “We will make you conceive and birth Hindu children”. Some men tore at their clothes and some scratched their bodies and sexually abused them.

W44BW11: She is a Hindu woman married to a Muslim man and is in her early 30s. She was attacked by a mob of 200-250 people. She was physically attacked, robbed, brutalized and raped. The crowd wanted to kill her and she was very badly injured. She has filed a complaint and feels that she would commit suicide if she loses it.

W45BW12: She is a school teacher. She spoke at length about the educational issues vis-à-vis the Muslim community, especially regarding women. She also spoke to the panel about the challenges for human rights organizations, especially in the context of fear, loss of trust and of hope of the Muslim community.

W46BW13 : She spoke about the Hindu-Muslim dynamic as well as about the relatively recent attacks against the Christian community. She also narrated to the panel the attempts at moral policing and the violence unleashed by the Sangh Parivar.

W47BW14 : She, a Muslim woman living in a Muslim area, spoke to the panel of her struggle to file an FIR when she was beaten up by the police and sustained multiple fractures. She was abused by the police and was sent back several times when she went to file the FIR.

W48BW15 : She spoke at length about the violence on women. She met women in the camps, who were suffering from trauma of having to leave their homes, seeing people slaughtered, children being hurt, animals killed and witnessing all kinds of violence.

W49BW16 and M1BM34: They spoke to the panel at length about the negative role of health professionals at the time of the carnage. They also spoke about the abysmal conditions of health and sanitation in the camps and about the bad and hostile situation in government hospitals.

W50BW17 : She spoke about the role of the media in the carnage – about how rumours that were being spread by various means. She reported that Sandesh has played a role in actually manipulating sentiments by misreporting, fanning rumours and creating a communal wave.

W51BW18 and M2BM37: They live in an area that is one of the most violence-affected areas in the city. BW18 and BM37 along with their friends and family saved a lot of Muslim

lives right from the first day of the carnage, when Muslims came to their house to ask them for shelter. They kept 500 Muslims with them in their house and their relatives' houses near theirs. The next day the people who had taken shelter with them told them to send them to a safe place, as they feared that the people giving them shelter would be targeted. They narrated several ways in which they are being harassed.

W52BW19: She lives in the old walled city, where the mob could not reach, because those areas were Muslim majority and had narrow lanes etc. So there was no violence by the mobs. The police, however, have harassed women 3 times in combing operations here. Some women were repeatedly beaten up. The police have harassed women who were in 'iddat', pregnant, old women, women who had stitches from earlier surgeries were beaten there thus hurting them more. After the police beat her up she has great difficulty in walking.

W53BW20: She spoke about continuing harassment from the police - abuses, beating up of people, animals, sexual abuses and other harassment like breaking the electricity meter or bulbs etc. Constant harassment as the constant feature of life was what she narrated to the panel.

W54BW21: She spoke of constant police harassment and torture. She talked about her sister-in-law who was 9 months pregnant and was yet beaten up by the police for no reason what so ever.

W55BW22: She talked about an attack that had taken place on the day she came to talk to the panel. She talked about an 18 year old girl who was 5-6 months pregnant and was hit her on the chest. She had a premature baby, but she could not lactate. This young girl who had faced the harassment was so afraid that she refused to come. Her breasts were bleeding for a month.

W56BW23: She has been helping in maintaining peace in the area where she lives and works specifically with women. She also spoke of the effect the violence is having on the youth in her area. She was especially worried for her teenage son who had stopped communicating with her.

W57BW24: She talked to the panel about continuing violence and harassment by the State, about arbitrary arrests, about continuing destruction of Muslim property and religious symbols. She talked about the constant threats to kill and arrest that her family members also faced.

W58BW25 and other women from her village (who did not want to be identified at all) narrated how earlier the atmosphere in the village was very friendly. This time too they were assured that they were safe and the next day they were attacked. Apart from the total destruction and devastation they faced, the sense of betrayal was also very strong and hurtful. They also talked about how they are still not allowed to live and work as earlier and that they had come to talk to the panel at a great risk to their lives. There was one Dalit woman who had supported them and she also came to speak to the panel.

W59BW26: She lives in a village where there was immense destruction, looting and killings. She narrated her experience of those days and the fact that it has not been possible to begin life anew.

W60BW27: She and her family were the first to return to the village. She recounted how they were stoned when they returned and how they were made to feel unwelcome and intruders in their own house and village. The police were equally callous and that is the atmosphere in which they had to begin life anew.

W61BW28: She works with an organisation that is working especially with young girls, and was extremely concerned about the increase in insecurity of the Muslim community due to this carnage and the impact that is taking place on the education and mobility of girls.

W62BW29: She is a postgraduate student from the university. She narrated the stress she experienced during the examinations and the impact that actually had on her ability to study and hence on her performance. The feeling of insecurity and lack of trust was the underlying feeling too. So was the determination to do well.

W63BW30: She is a teacher from the university. She narrated her frustration at seeing Muslim women who intended to give their exams not being able to do so due to the prevailing insecurity and also at the insensitivity of the University authorities for not postponing the exams to a time when the possibility of Muslim students coming was relatively more. She also presented before the panel some of her observations about the overall atmosphere in the University due to the growing Hindutva presence.

W64BW31: She is postgraduate student from the university. She had to leave her house and move to safer areas. The neighbours were still quite hostile. But she managed to give the exam and also pass.

W65BW32: She studies in BV55 school in the 11th grade science. She took the exams during the attacks, had to stay and study in a relative's house. She wanted to top the class, but

because of the carnage she got only 93% and came 5th in the city! All her friends are girls from the Hindu community and she has not seen any change in their behaviour towards her. She is encouraged by her father to do well. She wants to become a doctor.

W66BW33: She is also in class eleven. She too took her SSC exams when all this happened. Whenever she sat to study images of burning people would come before her eyes; she would find it difficult to study. Her parents and teachers would encourage her to study. She too wanted to do really well but couldn't. She got only 91% and did not get a rank! She changed her school recently to another in a Hindu dominated area. She is the only Muslim in the whole class there.

W67BW34: She has been doing a lot of work with children in camps. In their work they have noticed that when children saw the colours red and yellow they could not tolerate it. They would start getting agitated and traumatized. She also spoke at length about the hostility of some of the teachers and about saffronisation of the textbooks.

W68BW35: *She is an activist in Gujarat and helps several organizations. She shared some of her observations regarding the changes in enrollment patterns for girls in schools after the carnage.*

W69BW36 and M3BM48: They are lawyers and spoke of the legal situation in some of the cases. BM48 also appears in the *Sabarmati* Express case.

Women from four villages that were very badly affected and who did not want to be identified in any way:

They have been getting constant messages from the village that it will happen again and that they should leave. One of them said that her younger daughters heard this and started screaming. She sent her daughters to another village that has a larger Muslim population.

Another woman spoke about the sexual assault on women and its impact on women. There are many young girls who have suffered this but cannot talk about it because of the negative attention they will get and the fact that they will not be able to get married.

One woman said she did not want to go back to the village. Her daughter-in-law was sexually assaulted.

Some of these women were talking about their experiences of assault for the first time after almost ten months.

Women of another village also told the panel about the treachery of their neighbours and about the horrors of the carnage and its aftermath and about false charges put on Muslims to pressurise them to withdraw cases. Others present reported that the police put up peace committees on which they put the very people who conducted the attacks. Women spoke of being forced out of their own lands despite having lived in the same place for 40 years. Women talked to the panel about the educational loss for their daughters and for Muslim children generally. They spoke about the loss of livelihoods and loss of means of earning as they have not been able to feel secure enough to start; for the majority it has been a denial of all their entitlements, like land, cattle, shops etc.

A woman told the panel how insecure the entire atmosphere is and how there is no sense of peace and security for people to begin to pick up their lives and begin.

W70AMW1 and M4AMM1: Their family was a victim of 28th Feb. attack. Their daughter is missing. Their household was isolated with in Hindu Community. Now, displaced to border and searching for livelihood sources. Their names were taken out from voters' list. They were hoping to get justice through elections. They lived as wage labourers, now living on charity.

W71AMW3: Her parents were attacked and when she tried to save them both her hands were cut. Her parents were shot dead. Uncle was attacked with swords. People from the mob tried to molest her but she threw chilly powder at them. They threw her down, she was badly assaulted, and then she was unconscious when they cut her hands.

W72AMW4: Her house was looted. She along with her mother was burnt, but she survived. She has not got any compensation for the crop and cattle that were burnt or taken away. The army is still there, so they feel safe, although they still cannot move around freely. In the FIR they have given names of attackers, who are now absconding.

W73AMW6: Her son and five other family members were killed and burnt in front of her eyes. Amongst the dead is one three-year-old child. The other four were burned and injured. She has no means of livelihood and they are surviving on charity .

W74AMW7: She had a family of eleven and eight of them were burnt to death, after being attacked with swords. Her husband and daughter died in hospital. They have got the compensation and the deposit bonds. Some NGO gave a sewing machine. She gets some charity from Muslim community organizations. She cannot read Gujarati so does not know what was written in her FIR.

W75AMW8: Her brother has been arrested four months back. In that area no Muslim had attacked any Hindus but still he was arrested from his workplace. They bailed him three times. He has been arrested under section 302. He was the only earning member. Her small business was burnt down. For destruction of property worth eight lakhs, she has got Rs. 6000 as compensation.

W76AMW9: Her daughter-in-law was pregnant and her womb was cut open. Mob was showing them Godhra train photo in paper and were saying they will do the same thing.

W77AMW11: She is surviving with small grandchildren. Her daughter is very scared to go back to their home. So she cannot return to where her home was.

W78AMW12: They lodged FIR in March. She witnessed her neighbouring women (five-six of them) being raped and molested. Iron rod and sword was inserted inside women and they were burnt later. The attackers were shouting that "No Allah would come to protect you ,now say *Jai Siaram*." "After we impregnate you, then only we will leave your family." They heard "*Maro, Kato, Jai Sriram*". They threw something in their house which caught fire immediately.

W79AMW15: She witnessed the police shooting a man and girl. She has also seen the use of gas cylinder as a weapon. She saw many girls being stripped and raped. She saw Hindu women pouring kerosene or some chemical powder so the bodies used to burn. In her area a board has been put up – No Muslims will stay here. The group FIR on behalf of 40 people does not give any details. All the rapists, murderers still move around in the area. They feel scared and constantly fear that they will be attacked again.

W80AMW17: She told the mob that she was not a Muslim and that is how she could get out. In her family out of ten only eight have survived. She questioned how come this Government arrests the people who are actually getting killed and attacked. People who had saved other people's lives are targeted and taken away. She also spoke of continued threats.

W81AMW18: This young girl was taken to an area and burnt. Her brother was also burned. She is recovering now from severe burns, after undergoing plastic surgery. All the people in her family except her grandmother have died. She would like to study further.

W82AMW19: She was attacked along with her young son. She got injuries on hand and head. She cannot use that hand. Her two and half year son was killed. Her husband has lost his job. Everybody is unemployed.

W83AMW27: Police told them that they would not help and also will not spare the Muslims as they did not want any Muslims in Gujarat. So her family ran out of their houses and then the house was looted by people from their locality. She could not lodge the FIR because police were part of the attackers. Hindus are threatening and intimidating even now.

W84AMW28 Mob came from near by society and threw tires inside the Mosque where young children were hiding. Women were beaten. He was forced to come out of the mosque and was beaten by the police. Police arrested many people from the community. This happened in March and in April too.

W85AMW29: Police entered their house at 2 am in morning. They used very abusive languages. Said they will shoot her in the chest. They said they would rape her and took away her son and husband. Their jewellery was stolen and household goods destroyed. She could not file any FIR as the police who attacked were on duty.

W86AMW30: Her husband was killed on the road. He was travelling in a shared rickshaw with some Bajrang Dal and Sena members when his identity as Muslim got known and he was stabbed and killed.

W87AMW31: Her husband was driving his Bakery van when he was looted and beaten to death using metal pipes. Same day their shop worth Rs. 10 lakhs was also burnt. She has got the compensation amount for her husband's death. She has not got any money for the loss of property When the mob came attacking, near her house, some people tried to defend but the police was siding with the mob and pushing Muslims indoors. One brave woman argued with the police to be unbiased but she was fired at and also people doing Friday *namaz*. Two people died due to police firing.

W88AMW33: She is a young mother. Men from the Shiv Sena with orange bands on their heads came to their house in April. Her husband was taken to the terrace and the police shot him there. She knows the name of the policemen who shot him. Her brother-in-law took away the compensation arguing that she would be remarried.

W89AMW34: She has seven children. Husband is rickshaw driver but cannot work now. She spoke of police violence or at least violence by men who came dressed in police uniforms. She said that still they are afraid. In buses, rickshaw people watch them and give them different treatment.

W90AMW35 and W91AMW36: They were locked inside the house and kerosene and petrol poured from the roof. A boy pulled her out from the roof. The mob was shouting "*jai shri*

ram”, and were wearing saffron colour. Their complete *chawl* was burnt. They stayed in camp for seven months.

W92AMW37 and W93AMW38 : They described the mob and the attack and looting of Muslim owned fire crackers shop. She saw men stripping in front of her, saying they will show their strength. She described two of the leaders of the mob and said that although a mob 20-25 thousand was surrounding the police station, they survived because of a sensitive police Inspector.

W94AMW39: She had to disguise as a Hindu woman and travel back from her daughter’s house after the violence broke out. She worked extensively with wounded and pregnant women in the camp. She spoke of the terrible conditions in which women were brought to the camp and how most women and their families did not want to talk now. People are scared of the community reaction and also of the criminals.

W95AMW40, W96AMW41 and W97AMW42 : All three of them were from one area in urban Gujarat which was very brutally attacked. They described the mobs and the ways in which the women were sexually assaulted. One of them escaped because she said that she was a Hindu and one boy in the mob took pity on her. Her family members were killed, along with many others. All these women gave names of the people leading the mob. According to them none of the accused are under arrest as the complaints have been changed.

W98AMW46 : She was attacked along with her husband and child but managed to escape as due to a gas cylinder explosion, even the attackers ran away.

W99AMW47: Three persons in his family were killed, that includes the breadwinner daughter of the family. She said that even today they are threatened, “Id is yours but the swords are ours”. Her sons have discontinued their education. She is too ill to work and survives on charity.

W100AMW49 : She and her three small daughters hid somewhere and survived but she lost her husband and a three year old daughter. They were killed but since their bodies could not be identified, they are declared missing. She has got no compensation for their deaths. She has no means of livelihood.

W101AEW1: She is an activist woman from the Muslim community. She has visited at least 8 districts of Gujarat traveling through various villages and camps, has interviewed more than 100 women of whom 55 were gang raped. She said there was a pattern in all the crimes committed. She was also involved in a campaign during the elections and spoke of the experience to the panel.

W102AEW5: She has been involved in children’s education for the last 6 months. She has been spending time with children in various camps. She spoke about the trauma affecting the children and the need for individual counselling. She gave various recommendations with respect to children survivors.

W103AEW13 : Woman Lawyer and activist who spoke about the inadequate compensation given as aid, not as a right, and also showed the disparity in compensation given during earthquake and now. She also reported that 70,000 Muslims not allowed to vote based on non-acceptance of the M form.

W104AEW7 activist woman and AEM10 activist man : they spoke of the situation in camps and their work there. They spoke in detail about the functioning of VHP, BD , RSS and Durga Vahini through moral policing and threats. They also spoke about discrimination in schools They said that women would speak provided they were assured justice.

W105AMW52 and W106AMW39 : They worked in the camps that were set up in the cities. They described the awful situation of the women who came in and the difficulty of reaching medical aid. The police checking their vehicles carrying the wounded used to verbally and physically abuse them. Women used to talk about the rapes but now they don't for fear of being disowned by husbands. Young girls were married early in the camps itself. Previously AMW52 used to work in a public space, but now she no longer moves around alone as she has been threatened. She works from home and even to talk to the panel she came accompanied by someone.

W107AEW8: She is an activist woman and also gave a written statement about the atrocities. She spoke of the difficulty in following up rape cases due to people having moved out and also due to the difficulty in legally taking up cases of mass rape. She said that the sexual assaults were also planned in the Bajrang Dal camps and that a lot of pamphlets circulated which said that women should be assaulted, 'don't feel guilty to rape women of the other community.'

W108AEW10 : She is a woman activist and lawyer working on various developmental issues. She gave detailed documents on economic boycott faced by people from Muslim community and also various government resolutions showing inadequacy and bias in government measures. She shared how in the 1984 anti-Sikh violence, the government had set up relief camps, no one was taken to Sikh dominated areas. But in contrast in Gujarat all camps were in Muslim areas only.

W109AMW55: She worked in a relief camp for seven months. She used to do all work including cooking. Now she works with social organizations and earns her livelihood.

W110AMW57: Her entire house was looted. She got only Rs. 2500 as compensation. Her son used to drive a rickshaw owned by a Hindu. Now he is told, "you become Hindu", "How did you survive?" Her other son was also terminated from his job.

W111AMW56: Police shot her husband, when he went to ask for protection from a chasing mob. He died in hospital. She did not get any compensation or relief. She has children to look after.

W112AMW58: All her property got destroyed but she received only Rs. 2500 as compensation. Charity organizations helped her to rebuild her house.

W113AMW59: After the carnage, they have written on the door "don't come back here, if you come back here, you will be killed". She got very little compensation. She works with a social organization now.

W114AMW61: She lost everything in the violence and got compensation of Rs. 100 only.

W115AMW62: She got Rs. 100 in the camp and meagre ration calculated for six months. Nothing else. The ration is totally inadequate.

W116AMW63: Both she and her husband were doing textile work. She received Rs.150 for all destruction. The place where they lived and worked has RSS workers and so they don't get work. The company is also closed now. Their economic situation is very bad.

W117AMW64: She lost more than 40 people from her joint family in the carnage. When she went to work, the owner of the shop grabbed her neck and said, “you know what happened to women in certain area, we’ll do that to you too.”

W118AEW11 and W119AEW12: They were activists of an organization whose emphasis was healing and rebuilding. They also worked with Government. They helped get FIRs registered for families whose houses were burnt. They met the Collector, had a dialogue with him and in some cases got increase in compensation. They also provided the people the means for economic survival.

W120AMW65: She spoke of the sexual and other violence that the police subjected her to in her own house on 21st April. They also abused her young daughter.

W121AMW66: Police always attack young girls. They even said, “we will insert this stick up your vagina” On 21st they attacked 11 areas. Men would be standing all around on the terraces of surrounding buildings. They would strip and so would the police. They used to fondle their genitals and call out to women.

W122AMW67: She spoke of the attacks by one particular police officer on women and children. She said that he even sexually assaulted women inside the camps.

W123AWM68: Her foot was injured when police threw some bomb at her. She described the sequence of events when the police entered their areas.

W124AMW69: She spoke of how the policemen desecrated the Quran. She said that a one and a half year child was picked by the police and thrown. When the women protested, the police said, “reproduce more and make more terrorists.”

W125AMW70: She described how the rapid action force men entered their area and beat her and other women indiscriminately on vagina, back, buttocks, and thighs.

W126AMW71: She described the ways in which the police attacked their properties and their bodies even during the violence. The men in the mob accompanying the police who were standing on the terrace of the area took off their trousers and started to shout. “Where are the terrorists? Come out now. Call your god.” Police continued to harass them till the army arrived in the evening.

W127AMW72: The police entered their building, and started firing tear gas and guns. The police bullets hit her husband and daughter, who were inside the house. Police would not even allow them to be taken to the hospital. Finally when they were being taken to the hospital they died on the way.

W128AMW73: She told police used to enter the house and beat up small girls and women. A six-month pregnant woman got aborted due to the beatings. Police said, “ We will arrest all your men and make you prostitutes.” The BJP MLA says, “This is our government. We will make this whole area Hindu. All mothers of Muslim are fucked.” She said that now even firecrackers traumatize children.

W129AMW76, W130AMW77, W131AMW78, W132AMW79: They described an incident of police violence when the police entered the community area and started firing. One bullet entered in W130AMW77’s thighs. After the police left, the neighbours took her to the hospital. After two months the police came for her, arrested her and put her in jail for six days. W129AMW76 was beaten up inside her own house and also arrested after two months police. She was released after three days. W131AMW78 had gone to dispose waste,

when a police bullet injured her. She was admitted to the hospital. Later after one month police arrested her. She was in the jail for 26 days.

M5PM1: He has been helping lot of people in the relief camps. He spoke very strongly of the need for continuing support from people outside of Gujarat, especially in the courts when cases are being heard. He spoke about the difficult court proceedings and also of the desperation of the Muslim community in the absence of justice.

M6PM7: He is a survivor of the violence and also one of the relief camp organizers. He testified that everybody knows it is state terrorism. The state government has done it. The Muslim community has no hope or belief in the state. The anti-Muslim wave is international. The effort to divide the minority and majority is at its highest in Gujarat. Women have faced the worst impact. They did not have the wherewithal to deal with sexual assault. Many NGOs from within India have helped.

M7PM8: He is an active political worker and also part of the camp co-ordinations. He expressed that without the NGOs the Muslim community could not have gotten to back on its feet. They were isolated and continuously threatened and could not have approached the state administration to make complaints. In some place animals were scavenging on dead bodies, the NGOs got the collector to send vehicles to pick up the bodies and finally they were buried

M8PM9: He is the principal of a college. He has written many books. He spoke to the panel about the communal history of the area and the role various political parties have played over the years and the various issues that have been communalised since the independence.

M9PM10: He is an old activist who has seen India since independence. He spoke to the panel about the history of Muslim communities in the region and history of the region that has seen many communal flare ups in the past fifty years.

M10PM11: He has witnessed many communal situations in past years. He gave a written document on the history of communalism, and its social, political, and economic aspects. He spoke about the Hindu Right wing propaganda for economic boycott of Muslims. He also gave some pamphlets about the same.

M11PM12: He is the principal of a school.

M8PM9, M9PM10, M10PM11, and M11PM12 together gave brief history of that area and various situations through which they have struggled. In every riot Muslims have been the sufferers, economically, socially and in terms of human life. The last 10 years were relatively peaceful compared with what has happened now. Various national and international events added to the hostility and to the prejudice against Muslims. The seeds were already sown in the minds of the Hindu community. The role of the state in combination with this groundwork has caused the present situation.

M12PM13: He is one of the relief camp organizers. He spoke about the participation of tribals in the4 carnage and how they were given liquor, so they could do anything. Further legal immunity was granted to the lower castes and tribals. But later, this has been used against them, to blackmail them further.

M13PM15: He is one of the relief camp organizers. He gave written documents detailing the violence suffered by Muslim community as they were brought to relief camp from

surrounding villages. He spoke about Muslims keeping Hindu drivers to save their cars, but Muslim drivers not getting jobs. He also spoke about the long term effects of the carnage on the Muslim community.

M14PM16: He gave a written document detailing the need for impartial investigation and special judicial officers. He also emphasised the need for impartial police force to be deployed.

M15PM18: He is an activist from the Hindu community working in the tribal areas. He spoke to the panel about the spread of Hindutva in tribal areas and the role of tribals in the Gujarat carnage. He spoke about the various programmes the various right wing organisations run in rural and tribal areas and how even schoolteachers take leave to participate openly in these programmes.

M16PM19, M17PM20: They both are working with relief committees. They said that the sense of fear experienced by Muslims since the violence is compounded by their inability to return to their homes. Now it has increased because of the election results. The condemnation issued by the Muslims of burning of the train in Godhra has never been published in Press. In the past they have had dialogues with VHP to try and understand what the Hindu community felt and allay their fears and misconceptions about the Muslim community. They feel that there is now a portrayal of Muslims as terrorists. But anywhere in the world where Muslims have risen up one will see that it is as in reaction to injustice. You can look at the examples of Palestine, Kosovo, Afghanistan... and India.

M18PM21: He is an activist working in the relief camps. He stated that rehabilitation was far from complete. Many villages are still as they were when destroyed. People are not going back to the villages. Livelihood is also one very crucial issue. Insecurity and fear haunts the Muslim community. He also spoke of the various problems in accessing the meagre compensation that were give. Many people who did not own houses according to Government records are not being given compensation.

M19PM22: He is an activist working on relief and rehabilitation. He said that everyone is almost certain that something will happen again. People have no money to insure house or business. Any way the compensation money was not enough to start a business or build a house. Those who have got help from the government in terms of compensation have used that money for survival.

M20PM23: He is a medical doctor from Muslim community who helped many victims. He organised an operation theatre. People could not go the Civil Hospital, which is meant for both communities. They had seen that these women/patients were not given food for thirteen days there. Also wants to start work in field of education.

M21PM24: He handed over a written profile of the community and its losses. The Muslims have had shops there for more than 100 years and there has never been any violence on them up to 1990. But in this violence their houses were completely destroyed. Houses, shops and factories were blown off by use of some chemicals. He also spoke about the present situation of businesses and the difficulties they were facing.

M22PM25: He is a lawyer from the Muslim community, who believes that the judiciary is still alive and still hearing them. That is the only place where the common person can go. Feels there should be some provision for impartial investigation. Laws have to be effectively

implemented. Public prosecutors are not functioning without bias. The court is a custodian of everyone's personal liberty. Nobody can take it away.

M23PM27: He was active in relief work and also suffered many losses during the violence. He spoke at length about the political and economic situation of the Muslims in the area. He thinks that no political party wants Muslims. The Muslim community has been pushed to the side and none of the administrative institutions are fair to them. He felt that law and order too are against them. There are many forms of economic boycott and he spoke about the experience of various trades in the region.

M24PM38: He is one of the activists of an organization. He stated that all the schemes are top-down. People do not have the space to decide what they want. Casual labour, like loading trucks, is the only option left. Contractors are not employing Muslim skilled workers for construction. Now the Hindutva of all these employers has emerged so they are not employing Muslims. Amongst displaced people, suicidal feelings are on the rise. Even sharecropping is not an option. Spoke at length on livelihood issues.

M25PM39: He was active in relief work. He said he wonders now if Hindus will keep any relations with them at all, how will they relate to Muslims, what kind of relationship will be possible? Will they attack Muslims at drop of a hat? Will they have any business with Muslims?

M26PM40: He was active in relief work. He felt that today Muslims want peace, they want to re-establish relations with the Hindus and live in harmony, to live at a human level. They do not want any party, neither BJP, nor the Congress. He felt that neither of these parties could be trusted.

M27PM41: He was active in relief work. He spoke about the various forms that economic boycott was taking. He said that just one day earlier, Muslims in the transport business in the village were told that they couldn't ply their passenger vehicles here. He said that the Hindu Right Wing's main focus will be on the slaughter houses, they will go away with our cattle, raid our shops, not let us continue.

M28PM42: He was active in relief work. He spoke of the present economic and social condition of the Muslim community. He, along with other relief workers and camp organisers also discussed at length the responses of the Muslim community to this kind of violence. Many spoke of the need for more education and reforms within the community. Some felt that the education of girls and women needed to be paid close attention to as well.

M29PM43: He was active in relief work. He felt that the polarisation between the communities is acute. After elections, Muslims have been cornered. He spoke about trying to have community dialogues towards peace.

M30PM44: He was active in relief work. Amongst other economic losses and the problems of restarting or continuing with livelihoods, he spoke about the slaughterhouses which are mostly in the hands of the Muslims and are now being closed down. The intention is to cripple and stop the slaughterhouses and also to move business into other communities like tribals.

M31BM1: He is a lawyer and works in 9 talukas of rural Gujarat. He told the panel that in these talukas 103 villages were affected by riots and 5670 families were badly affected. This included looting and burning of houses and shops as well as seriously injuring and killing people and sexually assaulting women.

M32BM2: He is a paralegal worker from BV28 taluka. He spoke about village BV29, where 107 houses were completely destroyed, 14 Muslim men were cut alive, and 3 Hindu men were killed by Hindu mobs as well. He also spoke about the adversarial attitude taken by the police vis-à-vis the Muslims.

M33BM5: He is a paralegal worker. He has been working to get information on atrocities committed in the attacks on Muslims.

M34BM6: He is a paralegal worker. He told the panel that it was mostly the Muslim community that was attacked and women were targeted as well as men. He also talked about how the victims and survivors were being forced to compromise and take back their cases.

M35BM10: He is from BV13 village, unable to go back. He was living in the BV5 relief camp. He had his own business and has suffered major losses. The Patels are telling him to take his case back under threat of life. Since he has refused, there is a false case made up against him.

M36BM11 to M42BM17: They spoke together to the panel about the political situation in their area in view of the expected election results. All these people were active in relief and rehabilitation work and were also part of community peace efforts.

M36BM11: He works in the education field and on women's welfare, rights and rehabilitation.

M37BM12: He also works on women's welfare, rights and rehabilitation.

M38BM13: He belongs to the Congress party. He has done relief work during riots, and is the municipal councillor (an elected representative).

M39BM14: He is a corporator and a Congress party worker. He talked at length to the panel about his observations and analysis regarding the electoral and politically dangerous games of the Sangh Parivar, especially of the BJP, both historically and in the present context.

M40BM15: He works with various cultural and religious organisations. He is also a journalist. He works with an organisation working with minority communities.

M41BM16: He is a herbal medical practitioner, gives free medicines for help and service, not for money. He has also done some relief work in his village.

M42BM17: He spoke at length about the prospects after the election results. He felt that there is no option but for Muslims and Christians to come together. He spoke about the way in which Hindu people helped the Muslims during the riots.

M43BM18: He told that panel that in their village they used to live peacefully. They have filed cases and it is because of this that they are not being allowed to go back and hence they are in a lot of trouble. They are 15 families and have no means of livelihood.

M44BM19: He lives near the fields on the outskirts of his village. He and two other neighbouring families are the only ones from their village to return back. They had attempted to start their shop there but the Patels threw everything away and told them to stop and take back their legal cases first.

M45BM20: He too is being forced to take back the legal case. When he and others displaced from his village went there on the day of the election, they were not allowed to come in. All the 15 families in the village were not allowed to vote.

M46BM22: He used to have a shop in his village. The shop was looted and nothing was left in it. He made a police complaint. The people from the majority community are asking him to leave the village. People do not sit in their auto rickshaws. Only 3 families have gone back to the village.

M47BM23: He had to leave his village. Their shop and house was looted. They have filed a case, sent by registered post to the DSP's / magistrate's office because they could not make a complaint with the police. They have got no relief or compensation. There is constant tension that something will happen again.

M48BM31: He has worked with human rights organisations and spoke to the panel about the history of communal tensions in the city and the state.

M49BM32: He gave a brief overview on how the violence occurred in some cities of Gujarat. He talked about State complicity in the 2002 carnage of Gujarat.

M50BM33: He is a Professor at the University. His house was also attacked in February 2002. For him, the most significant aspect of the carnage was the involvement of the Dalits and the Adivasis in it. He also spoke at length about patterns of sexual violence.

M51BM35: He talked about a Muslim medical centre that runs a hospital that caters to and provides medical facilities for all communities. This centre was burnt during the carnage.

M52BM36: He spoke largely about election related issues. He spoke to the panel about the history of electoral and communal politics in Gujarat and the different communities and castes that played a role in the state elections.

M53BM41: He talked about his experience of the carnage and the fear, terror and isolation they experienced just before the carnage vis-à-vis the neighbours, the police and the State.

M54BM44: He witnessed his son-in-law being killed. He himself was attacked and given up for dead. He wants to pursue his case.

M55BM45: He is fighting for his right to stay on the land where his house once stood. The municipality seems to have seen the carnage an opportunity to get rid to people and their houses.

M56BM46: He works in a Muslim dominated area and has been active in providing relief after the attacks. He spoke of the increasing ghettoization and its impact on the community at large.

M57BM47: He teaches in rural Baroda. He spoke about how in his own college Muslims were incited by pressuring and isolating them to get violent.

M58AMM7: Bajrang Dal people came in white shorts and with saffron headbands. The family tried to run to police head quarters but were not allowed inside. Police said, "Today we will not allow you in, because order from higher up, not to save you. We will do the same thing that happened in Godhra." The police forced them to leave. The mob caught his son and he was beaten up. The names of the accused are given in the FIR but the police have not arrested them.

M59AMM8: All the people in his family were killed and burnt. His daughter was in the hospital with 80% burns. She recognised some of the attackers. She died but gave her statement to the police before dying. Her name and papers were changed in the hospital. He also identified two of the people who led the mob. He spoke of a survey conducted some

months before the carnage by some women in their predominantly Muslim area about family size, property etc.

M60AMM12: He got burnt near his residential quarters. His brother in law died due to burns on the spot. His wife was injured severely. More than half of his family died and others got injured. His wife's hand and head had cuts and her left hand is completely disabled. They tore away her clothes. He felt betrayed, as he knew all of the attackers, who were government employees. Not a single one is arrested. He wants Justice.

M61AMM13 (child): He was beaten up by pipes. His parents were burnt alive in front of his own eyes. He is the only survivor. He has witnessed killing of a pregnant woman and the mutilation of her foetus. The mob was shouting "*Jai Sriram*". Eight people from his family were killed because did not say "*Jai sriram*." He was child worker. Even today he feels scared and cannot sleep. Most of the children in the camp felt the same. In the camp, a few organisations came to work with them.

M62AMM14: He described the way in which their area was attacked. There was some chemical powder used which immediately caught fire and petrol, diesel, tyres were used to set fire. Three people died in his family. He witnessed the well-planned attack with all weaponry. He helped take out fifty-eight bodies and twenty-six people alive. Ten out of twenty-six died in civil hospital and sixteen survived. Police took them to the hospital. Some people are still missing.

M63AMM24: When everyone was running, his mother got caught as she could not run fast. She was asking for water, they poured kerosene in her mouth and set her on fire. A woman who came to help his mother was also stripped and burned. He refused to give name of the attackers as they are all roaming around in city.

M64AMM25: When mob attacked the society, his four children were killed and burnt. He has got compensation for this. He could survive because he was hiding on the first floor of house.

M65AMM26: He and four others hid in a kitchen when they were attacked. The two women with him were raped and killed in front of him and he can identify the culprits. He managed to hide and escape and described the gory scenes that he saw when he was taken out with about a hundred survivors by the police. He said the crowd was asking the police to hand over the survivors to them, but the police said, "we had given you time till 5.00 p.m. And still so many of them have survived. You people are not efficient. You have lost your chance now."

M66AEM6: He is a lawyer and an activist very active in the democratic rights movement. He spoke at length about the proceedings in the *Sabarmati* express case and in the Shah and Nanavati Commission. He also gave a written account of some of the evidence led in these two.

M67AEM1, M68AEW2, AEW3, M69AEM2, M70AEM3, M71AEM4 : They are all legal activists working with survivors of the carnage. They spoke of the biases shown by the police in the recording of statements and the following investigations. They also spoke of how the doctors and other medical persons participated in this anti Muslim attack by either destroying medical evidence or by victimising the victims. Patients with serious injuries were in hospital but no statements were taken. Very few post-mortem reports available, along

with charge sheet. AEW2 and AEW3 also gave written submissions giving details of police complicity in some cases.

M72AEM8: He is a human rights activist, involved in election monitoring. Post *Babri Masjid* he was beaten up badly. He has been beaten up number of times. Now he anticipates subtle torture, like discrediting and obstruction of work. He also spoke of the ways in which the Hindu Right was working in Gujarat through monitoring inter-religious marriages and conducting surveys.

M73AEM9 : He is a human rights activist and researcher and spoke and gave a written submission on situation of rehabilitation and compensation. He also said there was only relief and no compensation given as citizens' right.

M74AMM34: A police bullet is lodged in his spine. His brother and brother-in-law who came to help were also shot at. His brother-in-law died on the spot. They changed four houses to save themselves in that injured state. He is completely paralysed below the waist but the hospital declared him 30% disabled. He cannot ask for compensation, as he is scared that they will put him in prison because of the bullet injury.

M75AMM35: He works with the state government. During the carnage he could not attend his duty and asked for leave. After rejoining and working for five months they made him resign from his job. He was orally dismissed on charges of absenteeism.

M76AMM36: His whole house was burnt and he got injured on the head. He lost property worth one lakh and only got Rs. 500 as compensation although in the survey the damage was estimated as Rs.65,000.

M77AMM37: His entire family is involved in social work. His mother's father was killed in '69 riot, father killed in '85 riot. He had his business. His machines were burnt. Now he helps out in camps.

M78AMM38: He spoke of the earlier carnage in 1969, when he was 8 years old. He remembers being on the road with his grandfather when grandfather was beaten by sticks and both his aunts were stabbed. He remembers being saved by some Hindus and how they travelled in the jungle for 3 days, till the army arrived. Now again this is happening to him.

M79AMM39, M80AMM40, M81AMM41: They were all relief camp organizers and spoke of the conditions under which the camps were set up and the lack of support and interference from the government . Government still had not paid money for the relief camp. They were almost forced to close the camp. Unofficially people continue to stay, as they had no place to go.

M82AMM43: He worked in an Electronics Company. He was terminated when he went to get his salary. They asked him to sign on a resignation letter. They have not given him any other dues.

M83AMM44: He was teaching for the last 7 years in a school. He ran to his village during this carnage. When he returned after 15 days, he was terminated and later on charged with theft of school property.

M84AMM45: He was working in the furniture Industry for twenty years. He could not report to work for three months during the carnage. He was dismissed from the job because he is a Muslim. He used to work on the basis of piece work, but can not get even that kind of work now.

M85AMM46: He was working for ten years in a textile factory. Fifteen days after the carnage he came back from where he had fled. Some Hindu person had occupied his home. The proof of ownership was burnt in the violence. The police detained him because the owner of the factory lodged a complaint against him for threatening them by entering the factory premises. He has lodged a complaint against the factory owner and asked for reinstatement.

M86AMM46: He was working with a steel company for twenty-five years. There were only two Muslims in the factory. He was not given any dues and was asked to leave.

M87AMM48: He was a machinist in a chemical factory for 10 years. He was the only Muslim. He was terminated. His Hindu friend who stood by him was also terminated.

M88AMM49: He and another Muslim worker were terminated orally. No termination letter was given to them. He is planning to lodge a complaint. He is still living in a relief camp.

M89AMM50: He used to work in the chemical industry. During the violence also he went to work. In those days there were leaflets distributed saying, “do not allow the Muslims to stay in village.” Then one-by-one all the Muslims were asked to leave. He has lodged a complaint before the Labour Commissioner.

M90AMM51: He worked in a retail shop. On 28th Feb the mob set fire to his house and killed his pregnant sister. A good Hindu neighbour helped escape and then they took shelter with a Dalit family. They were in the relief camp for three months. When he went back to work, the manager kept taunting him, “You Muslims have killed so many, shouldn’t be here, shouldn’t have been saved, will definitely be killed etc.” He had no alternative but to leave the job.

M91AMM53 : He was terminated from his job and has no means of earning. His wife works but they cannot manage to pay for their children’s education.

M92AMM55: HE is a camp organizer. He said that from their camp not even 60% people have been rehabilitated. After camp closed down people continued to stay there for two months, as they had no where to go. He said that there were women in the camp who were sexually assaulted and that the police also use sexually abusive language, whenever they visited the camp.

M93AMM56: He was arrested and was in prison for three months, since a police bullet injured him. They took arrested him under sections 302 and 307. The police used to say Muslims look better in three places: “Pakistan, graves and Prisons”

M94AMM57: He reported the mob would say to women “we will rape you, your daughters, and your mothers.” They used to strip themselves and wag their genitals. His house was looted completely but got only 15000 as compensation.